



Draft minutes prepared on 23 February 2016 from contemporaneous notes
Draft minutes approved by the Chair via email on 24 February 2016

Approved by the Corporation:

Signed by the Chair

3/3/16
Date

Bradford College

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE CORPORATION HELD: Thursday 4 February 2016

Present:

Richard Wightman (Chair)	Governor
Mazn Amhamed	Governor (Student)
Paul Ashton	Governor
Angela Cawthra	Governor
Terry Davis	Governor
Eve Gregory	Governor (from 1625)
Robert Holden	Governor (Staff)
Nasreen Karim	Governor
Khan Muzzamil Nawaz	Governor (Student)
Cath Orange	Governor
Debbie Rolls	Governor (Staff)
Ramindar Singh	Governor
CIr Dale Smith	Governor
Andy Welsh	Governor (Group Chief Executive Officer)

The quorum was six Governors

In Attendance:

Jane Barrett	Head of FE Quality Enhancement (until 1835)
Alan Bradley	Health and Safety Manager (HSM) (for Items 7 and 13 only)
Gemma Dunn	Head of Marketing (HMktg) (for item 6 only)
Joanna Green	Clerk to the Corporation (Clerk)
David Hambleton	Group Finance Director (GFD)
David Harwood	Principal
John Kenyon	Vice Principal (VP)
Liz Knowles	Assistant Clerk
Gareth Osborne	Group Chief Operating Officer (GCOO)
Richard Thomas	Provost
Dawn Tucker-Brown	Group Director of Human Resources (GDHR) (for items 4 and 5 only)

The meeting was held in the Boardroom Bradford College commencing 1600 and ending 1840.

The meeting was chaired by Richard Wightman as Chair Elect.

1. Apologies and disclosures of interest

- 1.1 Apologies for absence were received from Dave Mann, Karl Oxford and for lateness from Eve Gregory. The Clerk confirmed the meeting was quorate.
- 1.2 The Chair asked for relevant disclosures of Interest. There were none. He reminded Governors to declare interests as and when necessary on the Agenda.

2. Minutes of the meeting of 17 December 2015 and 21 January 2016

- 2.1 The minutes of the meetings of 17 December 2015 and 21 January 2016 were both agreed as true and correct records and it was **AGREED** that the Chair be authorised to sign them.

RESOLVED:

- i. **To agree that the minutes of 17 December 2015 and 21 January 2016 are a true and correct record and should be signed.**

3. Matters Arising

3.1 Reporting Policy:

The Clerk identified that the draft policy is intended to encapsulate the expectations in terms of management reports articulated by the Chairs' Committee on 26 June 2015 and by Governors on the Trust Governor forum. Governors considered the draft policy and **AGREED** to adopt it.

RESOLVED:

- i. ***That the draft Reporting Policy reflects the views the Corporation has previously expressed about reporting.***
- ii. ***To approve and adopt the Reporting Policy with immediate effect.***

Clerk

➤ **Additional Item – Report on Incident in the David Hockney Building**

The Clerk advised that the Chair had authorised the addition of an urgent matter to the meeting Agenda.

Gareth Osborne, Group Chief Operating Officer (“GCOO”) reported that a student had been injured after falling from a staircase, having attempted to use the bannister as a slide. In response to a question, GCOO said management has taken advice and no report to the Health and Safety Executive is required. A post-incident report will be produced and shared with Governors in due course.

GCOO

1615 Timed business

4. HR Strategy 2015-2016 and HR Statistical Data

5. Annual Professional Development Plan and Evaluation Report

- 5.1 Dawn Tucker-Brown, Group Director of Human Resources (“GDHR”) spoke to her reports. She commented that the restructuring and redundancy exercise undertaken over the past year has impacted on staff morale and industrial relations generally; she said a key priority for 2015/16 is to address this.
- 5.2 Governors discussed the reports and commented (C) and asked questions (Q) as follows:
 - C The HR case work data will need to be broken down in greater detail before conclusions can be drawn from the involvement of male staff, BAME staff and those with disabilities, relative to other groups.

This was **AGREED**.

GDHR

- C Your report refers to the objective of having a workforce reflective of the local population in terms of ethnicity but does not include comparative data for the local population so we don't know how close we are to achieving it. It would be helpful to have this information.
- Clerk The Policy and Resources Committee asked for a report outlining the rationale for that objective, which was not produced before that Committee was wound up. Is this still required?
- It was **AGREED** that it was. GDHR
- Q Of all the 2016 HR Strategy Priorities, which in your view would most improve student success?
- GDHR Employee engagement and culture change.
- Q What is the culture that needs changing? At another institution I know of, outcomes were improved quickly by challenging staff who had low expectations for students based on their socio economic backgrounds and instilling the expectation that every student would exceed their expected benchmark despite their background.
- GCEO At the Equality and Diversity Committee meeting we discussed the need to bring people on board with change. There is a culture of "us and them" which we need to address; we need to all share more values.

1625 Eve Gregory joined the meeting

- Principal We are doing a lot of work around the Teaching and Learning Strategy and getting teachers to where they need to be to be aspirational to students.
- Q Given that we have a limited budget, what are the curriculum priorities for staff development and how are you allocating your budget in light of those?
- GDHR We have introduced a Future Leaders programme to develop current managers and help strengthen succession planning. It is about getting staff to be the best that they can be - to influence students to do the same.
- Q Can you give an example of where you would spend more money?
- GDHR That is on the agenda for the next Executive Strategy Away Day.
- Q Tell us the process for the allocation of resources. We need assurances that the staff development policy objectives will be achieved with the resources allocated and that this will represent value for money.
- GDHR The Executive determines the funding for staff development but the allocation is not fixed; I can submit a business case for additional funding.
- Principal The HR strategy aligns with the Further Education ("FE") improvement strategy so a key area for investment is functional skills teaching.
- VP In terms of whether the resource being put into staff development is having a positive impact on student outcomes and delivering value for money, you need to ask "what effect is it having?" If we can't show an impact, we need to redirect our spending.

- GCEO Normally this report would contain an evaluation: the evaluation of the impact of staff development.
- Clerk It would be helpful if the evaluation report identified last year's strategic priorities so that Governors can compare outcomes against the objectives that were aimed at.
- C The table of recruitment by age is missing.
- GDHR I will include it.
- C In terms of staff turnover in the FE area and the Higher Education ("HE") area, it may be useful to see where turnover is greatest.
- GDHR Yes we can get that information.
- Q Given the amount of change that staff have experienced, how would you categorise staff morale?
- GDHR I think that is one of the reasons why we want to improve because there was so much change last year with complete layers of management taken out, new roles added, no cross-college pay review, concern of staff over the area review, a lot of concern about constant levels of change.
- GCEO That is why employee engagement is one of the key strategy priorities.
- C As a staff member, I think there are areas that have improved; in some areas the strategic changes have brought people together and improved their engagement. It is worth looking at how different parts of the College have responded to the changes and make use of examples of good practice.
- Clerk Perhaps GDHR could provide a follow-up report picking up these points for the 4 April meeting, once the Corporation has received the HE Quality Improvement Plan.
- This was **AGREED**.
- C A number of reports we have received today have had a heavy FE bias. Could we please get our heads around the rest of the business.

5.3 There were no further comments or questions.

RESOLVED:

- i. That a follow up report shall be prepared and presented to the Corporation meeting of 7 April 2016.***
- ii. To receive the reports.***

Clerk/
GDHR

1645 Dawn Tucker-Brown left the meeting.

1650 timed business

6. College's Marketing Strategy and Planning; and Analysis of last year's Campaigns

- 6.1 Gemma Dunn, Head of Marketing (HMktg) presented the marketing strategy and the accompanying documentation. Governors made comments (C) and asked questions (Q) as follows:
- Q How does the strategy align to our most pressing priorities? We want to grow apprenticeships for example.

HMktg The strategy is aligned to the strategic plan but is a working document and this is a key time to reflect and update it. I should like to get clear direction as to where the Corporation feels resources should be directed.

Q How do you negotiate your funding or are you just given a budget?

HMktg The marketing budget is small for an organisation this size compared with competitors so we have to be careful how we allocate funds. The budget is tracked carefully and I meet with the Executive to discuss where funding has been allocated and where more is needed.

Q How do we judge the effectiveness of how you spend our money?

HMktg A lot of the post-campaign reporting you have seen is new to the College and the team and we have tried to establish a practice that we measure this after each campaign and collect data on outcomes. That is achievable soon and we will be able to correlate resources against results.

Q How much do you engage those involved in curriculum design in the marketing process?

HMktg We have a marketing analysis of where our shortages are, where our priorities are, and where the demand is. We need to make sure we supply what the marketplace needs and are looking to make sure our courses are what is needed, that we are competitive. All Heads of Department now engage with the analysis to look at their particular areas.

C What about the rest of the commercial strategy and alternative sources of income and employer engagement?

GCOO In the new structure we have the business development team with below-the-line, one-to-one targets. It is about generating sales leads and cross-selling - but leads are for FE as well as HE for employer engagement. City Training Services and Beacon Recruitment feed into the Apprenticeship Training Agency and so on. There is increased marketing support with a new person at City Training Services starting a business development team in the field. We identified there is a need to bridge the business development team and teaching staff in terms of curriculum development and a role is going through the approvals process. We are looking to recruit someone with lots of experience.

C Might we have what GCOO just said about marketing and business development on a sheet of paper. We need to understand the bigger picture and make sure it is all pulled together.

GCOO

This was **AGREED**.

Q Do we have a clear view of how we sit with the local press?

HMktg We recognised that we had a skills gap in terms of PR and communications, so in the Autumn term we took on a temporary member of staff to see if it would boost our PR presence and enable us to react quicker and smarter. It did work very well, so we have appointed a PR officer who is currently full to capacity building relationships and making sure we are out there with positives and is looking for anything reactive.

Chair Thank you very much for a very clear report which covers a huge amount of activity. Would the Corporation like to see marketing reports at least twice per year? We would like to help support the good progress, so I suggest we have a follow-up report in May.

This was **AGREED**.

C We should see its impact out there but with GCOO's sheet of paper we ought to be able to see the correlation between input and output.

RESOLVED:

- i. **GCOO shall prepare a paper on the relationship between marketing, business development and employer engagement;** GCOO
- ii. **To agree a brief for the marketing team at the April Away Day;** Clerk
- iii. **To receive a Marketing Strategy Update report at the meeting on 12 May 2016;** HMktg/
- iv. **To congratulate HMktg on an excellent report and to receive the report.** Clerk

1715 Gemma Dunn left the meeting. Alan Bradley joined the meeting.

7. Data Dashboard/Key Performance Indicators and Annual Business Plan

7.1 GCOO introduced the Annual Business Plan and Key Performance Indicators report and invited questions (Q) and comments (C). It was **AGREED** that the Item should be taken along with the new FE data dashboard: Appendix (i) to Agenda Item 10.

1720 Mazn Amhamed and Khan Muzzamil Nawaz left the meeting.

Q The principal achievement and success scores for HE and FE are not in. Is that because they have their own specific HE and FE dashboards, or would you not expect them to be in?

GCOO They are to report here, we would expect all HE and FE targets to come up on the Corporation dashboard.

Q Thus the opportunity to see if we are satisfied. Who sets the targets? It is usual for Corporation to set the targets, particularly student retention - and also to determine the College's risk appetite.

GCEO Corporation has approved targets on the recommendation of the Executive. The Executive has not been setting targets on its own.

C There needs to be a very robust discussion about what they should be then, because everything throughout the year should be about testing them.

Principal In populating the FE dashboard, we took on board comments made at the last Corporation meeting and we are looking for agreement on items to be measured and targets. We intend to give some in-year indications around retention; also where we are against allocations of budgets; and a forecast of what the turn out will be. The dashboard will be populated for the 10 March Away Day using benchmarks we have and that we would like the Corporation to approve.

It was **AGREED** that this should be on the Away Day Agenda. Clerk

Q I have not had time to read the Annual Business Plan in detail but are there any areas you are concerned about?

GCOO There are some areas, such as information technology (2.4.2), employer engagement (5.2, 6.3.2) and alumni engagement (3.4),

which we are on with but they are on a very long list. It is not as advanced as I would like it to be.

C Perhaps that is where we can have a discussion. We should be seeing that and enabling you to move them up the priority list.

Q The capital project is RAG rated 'red' and I would like more information on it.

GCOO It relates to one-off items of significant expenditure and efficiencies: How did we do in line with curriculum plans and the further restructuring of the Estates team as part of the Operational Improvement Plan?

C In the Key Performance Indicators report, what is the target for HE cohort success rates based on? A benchmark?

C It is difficult to obtain benchmarking information for HE institutions. I would say it was a fairly typical attrition rate for the kind of institution we are.

1725 Khan Muzzamil Nawaz rejoined the meeting

C HE doesn't share information in the same way that FE does. In my experience, 60% over three years is very good. It is possible to determine how many students are successful at the end of the first year of study and that is a useful measure as it is a good indicator of how many will complete.

7.3 There being no further questions or comments, it was proposed that the Annual Business Plan and the data dashboard be endorsed as working documents to be further populated and monitored as the year proceeds and this was **AGREED**.

RESOLVED:

- i. To set aside time at the March Away Day for FE target setting.*
- ii. To endorse the Annual Business Plan and FE Data Dashboard as working documents to be further populated and monitored as the year progresses.*
- iii. To receive the report.*

Clerk

Principal

At this point Governors **AGREED** to take Items 13 and 14 out of time.

13. Health and Safety Update

13.1 Alan Bradley, Health and Safety Manager ("HSM") spoke to his report, advising that good progress is being made towards putting all necessary mechanisms in place and implementing processes and procedures, although improvements are still needed in terms of chemical handling - we need to get better at housekeeping. A Governor asked whether HSM felt he had the necessary authority or support from management to make things happen in the way that he wanted them to. HSM said he was satisfied that he has good support from the Executive and everyone else: there is a will to move forward and get the job done.

1750 Mazn Amhamed rejoined the meeting; Ramindar Singh left the meeting

1752 Mazn Amhamed left the meeting

- 13.2 The Chair thanked HSM for his report and stated that the Governors had increased confidence in terms of health and safety and looked forward to future reports.

RESOLVED:

i. To receive the report

14. Health, Safety and Welfare Committee minutes 30 September 2015

- 14.1 The minutes of the Health, Safety and Welfare Committee meetings of 30 September 2015 and 16 December 2015 were received. There were no questions.

RESOLVED:

i. To receive the minutes of the Health, Safety and Welfare Committee meetings of 30 September 2015 and 16 December 2015.

8. HE Quality and Standards Monitoring

- 8.1 The Clerk advised that it was proposed that monitoring of HE Quality and Standards should in future be via the Provost's reports and the minutes of Academic Quality and Standards Committee, with either the Registrar and/or the Head of Academic Quality and Standards attending to answer any questions Corporation may have. This was **AGREED**.

RESOLVED:

i. That reports from the Academic Quality and Standards Committee should be added to the Corporation Annual Calendar of Business.

Clerk

9. Risk Management Report

- 9.1 David Hambleton, Group Finance Director (GFD) spoke to his Risk Management Report.

Some questions (Q) and comments (C) were put to GFD by Governors.

Q Does the Audit Committee monitor these risks?

GFD The Audit Committee is responsible for advising the Corporation whether there are effective controls in place and whether there is an effective framework for monitoring risk. It will challenge management's assessment of the levels of risk; seek assurances in respect of controls and consider whether there are any gaps.

Clerk The Corporation retains the overall responsibility for ensuring the solvency of the Corporation and the College.

Q I expected to see something about academic reputation, teaching and learning?

GFD We have a detailed risk register but Corporation asked us to focus on certain key risks; this time they are financial.

Q Is the risk register available online?

GFD No, but it will be eventually.

Q I was expecting to see something about the bank covenants?

GFD We do a report on a quarterly basis on the bank covenants.

9.2 There were no further questions and it was **AGREED** to receive the report.

RESOVLED:

i. To receive the report

10. Principal's Report

- 10.1 The Principal spoke to his previously circulated papers which included the FE Performance Report 2014-15, FE Performance Indicators, structure chart and a structure diagram. He said the proposals he had for restructuring the FE provision would necessitate broader discussion, so he intended to introduce them now with a view to presenting them in more detail at the Corporation Away Day on 10 March. This was **AGREED**.
- 10.2 In terms of FE outcomes, a headline success rate of 78.8% in 2014/15 was disappointing and without the interventions it would have been 72%. We can do more. Functional skills is a challenge: 56% of new starters this year (over 2,000 students) came to College without having achieved a C grade or higher in Maths or English GCSE.
- 10.3 In terms of areas for improvement, performance management, the style of reporting and the management of risk are all being reviewed. The Principal's view is that communication, including with Governors has not been as good as it might have been; as a consequence, opportunities to engage and intervene have been missed. He has now formed a Senior Leadership Team, with clear Terms of Reference and accountability lines and there is monitoring of FE performance on a weekly basis. The FE KPI data dashboard will help Corporation and Executive monitor progress. We have introduced Progress Coaches and are building confidence around the business planning process looking at income, numbers, expenditure not just performance.
- 10.4 The Principal referred Governors to Appendix 2 to his report, being a diagram showing a proposed new structure for FE. He said it maps out levels within the organisation, creates pathways to support progression from FE to HE and identifies the opportunity to grow sixth form provision.

1813 Angela Cawthra left the meeting

- 10.4 The new structure will have "go to" people - so there will be real identification and accountability. There is an opportunity to grow grant funded provision and we can look for employer engagement.
- 10.5 The Chair said the Corporation had already made its views known on performance and given that there is a clear plan of action for starting on an upward trend, Governors should focus their attention on the proposed new structure and on populating the targets column of the FE data dashboard. This was **AGREED** and the Executive was instructed to provide appropriate sector benchmarking data, information about previous years' performance, and recommendations, to inform target setting at the March Away Day.
- 10.6 It was **AGREED** that Eve Gregory would take on the role of lead Governor for FE Quality and Standards. The Clerk advised that the appointment of a lead Governor for HE Quality and Standards would be on the agenda for the next meeting, following receipt of the HE Quality Improvement Plan.

Executive

Clerk

There followed some comments (C) and questions (Q) from Governors.

- Q If we were to operate a sixth form provision, presumably it would have its own chief executive. Many of our students do cross-curricular programmes combining A levels and technical and vocational courses.

Would you foresee any conflict arising between the senior managers on the College side and the sixth form provision?

Principal They would work in conjunction with each other. It works now with Heads of Department.

Provost Clearly this needs more discussion. The Executive need to look at it before the Away Day.

GFD We need to have an away day ourselves so we can shape it further but the Principal is keen to reorganise and reshape the FE side.

C Are we creating more management positions after so recently removing so many and making redundancies? Is that a risk for the College?

GCEO Nothing is decided yet so we cannot answer that question at the moment. The discussions are at a very early stage and any restructure plans will need Corporation approval before they become anything more than a management proposal.

10.7 There being no further questions, Governors **AGREED** to receive the report and ask the Clerk to schedule time at the March Away Day to consider the proposals in more detail.

RESOLVED:

i. To receive the report.

ii. To discuss the proposed restructure in more detail at the March Away Day.

Clerk

1835 Jane Barrett left the meeting

11. Provost's Report

11.1 It was **AGREED** that the Provost's report should be taken as read and Governors moved to discuss the risk of Teesside University withdrawing as the College's validating partner. The Provost advised that the Vice Chancellor of Teesside University had informed him at a meeting that morning of the decision to write formally with a notice to withdraw as validating partner. The Provost stated that this will not affect recruitment for the coming academic year and that a working group will be established to look at protection of the student experience.

11.3 A discussion followed about alternative validation arrangements. The Provost said Teesside University had offered to assist the College in finding other partners. He acknowledged that there is a strategic discussion to be had as to whether to have more than one; he said he would not recommend having more than three.

11.4 A Governor asked are we quite clear and comfortable that it is a decision about them and not any concerns about us? The Provost replied that the decision was taken entirely because of Teesside's strategy refocus and a number of colleges are affected. We have received written confirmation of the reasoning.

11.5 Independent Governor Cath Orange, who chairs the HE External Advisory Group, said the Advisory Group's membership was supportive and would not be pleased by the recent update.

11.6 GFD drew members attention to Item 5 of his report: HE Fees and Bursaries, which required the Corporation's approval. A Governor queried whether it is possible to deliver the engineering programmes at the fee levels proposed

and the Provost said the courses were currently being delivered at that price; all the fee levels had been determined by competitor analysis.

- 11.7 It was **AGREED** that the proposed fees for 2016/17 contained in the Provost's report should be approved. There were no further questions or comments.

RESOLVED:

- i. To approve the fee levels contained at section 5 of the report;*
- ii. To receive the report.*

12. Update on Equality and Diversity Strategy following January workshop; and Minutes of Equality and Diversity Meeting of 6 January 2016

12.1 The minutes of the Equality and Diversity Meeting of 6 January 2016 had been circulated and Andy Welsh, Group Chief Executive Officer ("GCEO") gave a verbal update from the meeting of 3 February 2016. He said the strategy that is developing involves a stronger external focus and is concerned with behaviour in college and in life, preparing students for work and facilitating meaningful engagement with employers and the community. GCEO said the Equality and Diversity committee is functioning well.

12.2 The Chair said in view of the College transforming and the fact that the Equality and Diversity policy impacts on everything it does, the Corporation may wish to revisit the policy to ensure that it still reflects its values.

12.3 The Clerk advised that if the Corporation is contemplating a change of policy, it should move to address that as a matter of priority before management goes any further with developing the strategy, as the policy will inform the strategy. In the circumstances, Governors may feel that a material change is unlikely, in which case the strategic development work could proceed.

12.4 It was **AGREED** to receive the minutes and request that a further update be brought as and when appropriate.

RESOLVED:

- i. To receive the minutes of the Equality and Diversity meeting of 6 January 2016.*

15. Academic Board Synopsis 25 November 2015

The synopsis of the Academic Board meeting of 25 November 2015 had been circulated and as there were no issues arising it was **AGREED** to take the report as read.

RESOLVED:

- i. To receive the synopsis of the Academic Board meeting of 25 November 2015*

16. Minutes of Search Committee 7 January 2016 and proposal to appoint Dale Smith to the Search Committee

The draft minutes of the Search Committee meeting of 7 January 2016 which were subject to Chair's approval were received. The Corporation considered the recommendation that Dale Smith be appointed as a member of the Search Committee and his appointment was **AGREED** with immediate effect.

RESOLVED:

- i. To receive the draft minutes of the Search Committee meeting of 7 January 2016.*

- ii. **To appoint Dale Smith as a member of the Search Committee with immediate effect.**

17. Proposal to call a meeting of the External Affairs Committee

Declarations of interest in this item were made by the Chair, Terry Davis, GCEO and GFD as members of the Bradford and District ATA Board.

17.1 GCEO reported that we are now going through the process of reviewing the subsidiary companies and recommended that the External Affairs Committee should be asked to work with a smaller group of Governors to not only review the MCA Cooper Associates report but also consider a proposal to transfer the Bradford College Apprenticeship Training Agency into the College's sole ownership. This was **AGREED** and the Clerk was instructed to call a meeting of the External Affairs Committee.

RESOLVED:

- i. **To instruct the Clerk to call a meeting of the External Affairs Committee.**

Clerk

18. Revised Corporation Calendar

18.1 The Clerk tabled a revised version of the Corporation Calendar of Business for 2015/16 and this was **AGREED**.

RESOLVED:

- i. **To adopt the revised version of the Corporation Calendar of Business.**

19. Dates of Meetings 2016

The dates of future meetings were confirmed as:

Thu	3 March 2016 – Full Corporation Meeting	1600-1900
Thu	10 March 2016 –Away Day	1300-1800
Thu	17 March 2016 – new Governors Induction ONLY	1600-1800

20. Close

There being no further business the Chair thanked everyone for their attendance and the meeting closed at 1840.