

Bradford College

Draft minutes prepared from contemporaneous notes approved by the Chair in person on 10 April 2019

Approved by the Corporation: C. Orange
Signed by the Chair

20/6/2019
Date

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE CORPORATION MEETING
HELD: Thursday 04 April 2019 at 1600 hours
In the Board Room, Old Building

Present	In Attendance
Cath Orange (Chair), Governor	Dawn Leak (Director of Employer Responsiveness)
Geoff Alvy, Governor	Chris Malish (Director of Finance & Corporate Services))
Paul Ashton (Vice-Chair), Governor	Craig Tupling (Deputy CEO)
June Durrant, Governor	Sharon West (Interim Clerk)
Salsabil Elmegri, Governor (Student)	Elizabeth Kilner, Minute Taker
Robert Holden, Governor (Staff)	
Ann Kendal, Governor	
Sajjad Khan, Governor	
Dave Mann, Governor	
Matt Peel, Governor (Student)	
Debbie Rolls, Governor (Staff)	
Piers Telemacque, Governor (Staff)	
Chris Webb, Governor (CEO)	
Apologies	
Paul Birtles, Governor	
Steve Roberts, Governor	
Neil Ward, Governor	

The quorum was seven governors

L/J Denotes the time a Governor left/joined the meeting. Where the individual is not named in the minutes, a record is held separately and is available on request.

Item		Action
Housekeeping		
1	Chair's Welcome and Introductions	
1.1	The Clerk advised that the meeting was quorate and the Chair opened the meeting.	
1.2	It was noted that items 11 and 12 on the agenda were sensitive and confidential. The Chair therefore proposed that these items be taken at the end of the agenda and staff representatives will be asked to leave the meeting.	
1.3	The Clerk informed Governors that a single expression of interest had been received in the position of Vice-Chair from Paul Ashton. The Chair proposed Paul Ashton as Vice-Chair of the corporation.	

1.4	RESOLVED: That Paul Ashton be appointed as Vice-Chair of the Corporation.	
2	Apologies for Absence and Disclosures of Interest	
2.1	Apologies were received from Paul Birtles, Neil Ward and Steve Roberts.	
2.2	There were no specific or additional disclosures; the Chair reminded Governors of the need to declare conflicts as they arose.	
3	Minutes of the Previous Meeting of 14 February 2019	
3.1	RESOLVED: The minutes of 14 February 2019 were approved as an accurate record and the Chair was authorised to sign them.	
4	Matters Arising	
4.1	Governors reviewed the list of matters arising and discussed the following items:	
4.2	1. <u>Item 2 – Safeguarding Governor</u> The Chair was currently acting as the Safeguarding link Governor.	
4.3	2. <u>Item 4 – Committee Structure and Membership</u> The Chair confirmed that committee membership records had been updated and would be circulated to Governors for information. She intended to ask each of the Committee Chairs to review the skills mix of their Committee and identify any gaps.	
4.4	3. <u>Item 8 – Statement of Corporate Governance and internal control</u> The Statement of Corporate Governance and internal control formed part of the annual accounts which were to be signed by the Chair and the Chief Executive Officer (CEO).	
4.5	4. <u>Signing of the Annual Accounts</u> RESOLVED: Governors approved the Annual Report and Financial Statements for 2016-17 and 2017-18 and authorised the Chair and the CEO to sign them.	
Safeguarding		
5	Safeguarding Update	
5.1	The Deputy CEO updated Governors. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Since the rationalisation of the safeguarding team in September 2018 some significant enhancements had been made in the safeguarding function. • The safeguarding service continued to provide a robust response to students and staff who presented with risk of harm to self and others. The team had 	

5.2	<p>worked with 324 students to date relating to a wide range of issues.</p> <p>Q. How do we feed back to the Local Authority about impacts of funding cuts? A. This would be via membership of the new Bradford District Multi Agency Arrangements.</p> <p>Q. The numbers look alarming? A. It would be worrying if referrals were low in a college of this size.</p> <p>Q. Are there impacts of Local Authority Funding cuts e.g. CAMS? A. Yes. The College has a social worker as part of the safeguarding team. Cut backs have impacted on the number of referrals and the way they are dealt with.</p> <p>Q. Is this 324 individuals? A. Yes, 324 individuals with an average of 6 interventions per individual.</p> <p>Q. The report is very good but it does not cover speed of response? A. This can be included in the report.</p> <p>ACTION: Safeguarding reports to include an update on speed of response.</p>	DCEO
5.3	<p>ACTION: All governors to complete online safeguarding training.</p>	All governors

SR18: Safeguarding

Teaching and Learning

6	<p>Quality and Standards Update</p> <p>6.1 The Chair of the Quality & Standards Committee reported on the business conducted at the meeting held on 3 April 2019.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The focus of the meeting was Attendance, Retention and Progress and Learning. • A further meeting was planned for 23rd May 2019. • Overall attendance had increased to 85.1% but was still below the target of 90%. • Progress in Learning was making reasonable progress but Higher Grades were still a challenge. • Predicted outcomes were looking good but there was concern about accuracy given the issues last year. 16-18 was predicted at 82.7% vs 73.5% last year. 19+ was predicted at 86.3%. • The HE Quality Improvement Plan had to be submitted to the Office for Students (OfS) by end April 2019, an initial draft document was reviewed. The Chair and Rob Holden had been given delegated authority to enable the sign off by governors of the Quality Improvement Plan before the submission deadline of end April. • There was concern at the number of fail at first attempt and failed all 	
---	---	--

<p>6.2</p>	<p>modules.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HE would now be included on the Quality & Standards Committee and progress would be reported back to the Corporation. • Two key risks were identified. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Conditions for Registration with OfS being complete by August 2019. If this was not completed satisfactorily, the College would not receive funding in 2021. - Risk that the HE Validating Partner will not achieve the conditions for registration with OfS. <p>Q. How confident are we in predicted outcomes given issues last year?</p> <p>A. Predicted results were more accurate. Robust processes of moderation and validation had been put in place including external validation. There was regular tracking and monitoring. Enhanced performance reviews were being done to give extra scrutiny in areas of concern.</p> <p>Q. Is external validation across all areas?</p> <p>A. This is focused on areas of concern.</p> <p>Q. Who is leading on the OfS submissions and do we have sufficient resource?</p> <p>A. The Deputy CEO would lead and confirmed that sufficient resources were in place.</p>	
<p>6.3</p>	<p>The CEO informed Governors that progress data for English and Maths GCSE was published on the Department for Education's (DfE) website. Progress was a key measure, especially in English and Maths. The College had to make significant improvements.</p>	
<p>7</p> <p>7.1</p> <p>7.2</p>	<p>Data Dashboard</p> <p>The Deputy CEO updated on the Data Dashboard.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review was ongoing on the presentation of the data dashboard and this would be improved. • Key measures had been discussed under the Quality & Standards Committee item above. • Retention measures had improved significantly on the previous year. A data cleansing exercise was taking place to ensure data accuracy. • National data had been published on 28 March and was publicly available. Analysis would be undertaken to compare the College to sector and region for presentation to the Quality & Standards Committee. • As a headline, the College was ranked 163 out of 178 for FE. Apprenticeships were 62nd. <p>Q. Will the dashboard be communicated to all staff?</p> <p>A. Yes, but it was important to ensure that communications to staff included the right messages at the right time.</p> <p>Q. Will HE measures be included in the report?</p>	

	A. Yes. This is currently separate data and is currently being reviewed. HE data will be included in the dashboard. Apprenticeship data will also be included.	
8	Student Voice	
8.1	The Student Governors presented the Students' Union Update – Board of Governors March 2019.	
8.2	<u>Representation</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The union was in the process of electing student executive positions for the 2019-20 academic year. Elections were online for the first time. There had been issues with loss of facilities in Lister building due to roofing work. The Teaching staff were thanked for the help given to students. The Bradford College Legends event will take place on 11 June 2019. 	
8.3	<u>SU Priority Campaigns</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The 'Time to Talk' took place in February. There was a need for a dedicated social space in the college. Options were being considered for provision of catering in ATC. 	
8.4	<u>Student Activities</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Union Activities taster sessions had continued with over 550 students registered. 	
8.5	ACTION: Director of Finance & Corporate Services (DFCS) to provide feedback on the Lister Building issue.	DFCS
	ACTION: Deputy CEO to provide feedback on the request for Social Space.	DCEO
	ACTION: DFCS to provide feedback on the request for catering facilities in ATC.	DFCS
8.6	Governors thanked the Students Union representatives for the report.	
SR5: Failure to ensure achievement rates and value added increase and are above national averages SR8: Failure to improve the quality of teaching, learning and assessment SR16: Failure to improve on poor inspection grades and quality assessment outcomes SR13: Failure to close equality gaps in outcomes for learners SR6: Failure to ensure the curriculum is relevant, innovative, adds value and is of high quality and is planned and improved to meet the needs of learners		
Financial Strategy and Audit		
9	Audit Committee Minutes of 28 February 2019	
9.1	The former Chair of the Audit Committee reported on the business conducted at the meeting held on 28 February 2019.	
9.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposed changes to the 2018-19 Audit Plan. 	

<p>9.3</p> <p>9.4</p> <p>9.5</p> <p>9.6</p> <p>9.7</p> <p>9.8</p>	<p>RESOLVED: That the proposed changes to the 2018-19 Audit plan be approved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regulatory Self-Assessment Questionnaire. <p>ACTION: DFCS planned to present the Regulatory Self-Assessment Questionnaire to the next meeting of the Audit Committee.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strategic Risk Register format. <p>RESOLVED: That the format of the Strategic Risk Register be approved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy Reviews <p>RESOLVED: That the Anti-Fraud Policy, Anti-Bribery Policy and Gifts, Hospitality and Awards Policy be approved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Progress of data protection and compliance. <p>Progress had been made with the implementation of GDPR, although there were some actions that were not progressing as quickly as expected.</p> <p>There had been two reportable ICO breaches in the 12 months to January 2019 and 56 non reportable breaches.</p> <p>Q. Did we have to notify the ICO for the two reportable breaches? A. Yes. Follow up actions are in progress.</p> <p>Training on GDPR was 85% complete.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Changes to committee membership. <p>The changes to committee membership were noted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The tendering process for internal and external auditors had taken place. The recommendation from the panel was to appoint Wylie Bisset as internal auditors and RSM as external auditors. <p>RESOLVED: That Wylie Bisset be appointed as Internal Auditors.</p> <p>RESOLVED: That RSM be appointed as External Auditors. Governors looked forward to working with the two teams of auditors to develop effective control systems and risk monitoring.</p> <p>Q. Were DfE involved in the selection process? A. No. There would be no concerns as this was a robust process and all firms that had tendered were recognised within the sector.</p>	<p>DFCS</p>
---	--	-------------

	<p>Q. Does the risk register include staff pay as many staff are very demoralised? A. This should be added. Staff pay would be considered in longer term planning. Management were aware of the issues.</p> <p>Q. Do we have a communication issue with staff? A. Yes, the Executive needed to improve staff communications.</p>	
9.9	ACTION: Staff pay and staff morale to be added to the risk register.	CEO
9.10	ACTION: Communications with staff needed to be reviewed and improved.	CEO
10	Finance and General Purposes Minutes 14 March 2019	
10.1	<p>The Chair of the Finance & General Purposes Committee reported on the business conducted at the meeting on 14 March 2019.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governors' attention was drawn to the predicted shortfall in income for the current year and they were advised that the shortfall would be more than offset by savings in costs. • The reduction in income related to apprenticeships and the cap on funding for 16-18 year olds. • The Q2 forecast showed that the College was expecting to be in line with budget at EBITDA for the year due to savings on costs offsetting shortfalls in income. • The final budget for the next financial year would be presented to the Corporation for approval in June 2019. • The Restructuring Facility had been signed off on 12th March 2019 and all planned spend had been processed. • The Restructuring Facility Sub-Committee had now been disbanded as the agreement had been signed. 	
10.2	<p>Q. What is the size of the cost saving required? A. A reduction in staffing cost of £3.4m</p> <p>Q. Is the college looking at other opportunities to increase income? A. The Executive would look for opportunities to increase income, but would be taking a prudent approach.</p> <p>Q. How will the opening of the new college impact Bradford College? A. We expect it to compete more with 6th forms. Small 6th forms in the area were closing.</p>	
10.3	<p>Q. Do we expect the Government to change funding for BTEC? A. The consultation on T Levels was underway and there was potential for funding of BTECs to be withdrawn. The CEO intended to provide feedback to the DfE.</p>	
10.4	ACTION: The Executive to give a presentation to the Corporation on curriculum development in terms of horizon scanning and the impact on funding.	Exec

10.5	The Corporation recorded its thanks to the Interim Finance Director for all of his work and also thanked the members of the Restructuring Facility Sub-Committee.	
11	Annual Staff Survey Outcomes	
11.1	DFCS updated Governors. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Over the last 3 years the percentage of engaged staff had stayed the same at 45%, but in the last survey there had been a move from disengaged to passive (with passive showing as 47% whilst previously it was 18%). Key issues were 'Executive managers are effective in making informed decisions about the organisation' and 'I feel I have job security'. The survey outcomes would be used to inform how we moved forward in the business planning process. 	
11.2	<p>Q. It is a concern that the score for 'I have the equipment and materials to do my job' was 41.8%?</p> <p>A. Investment has been made in IT recently.</p> <p>Q. This is basic learning equipment, not just IT?</p> <p>A. This will be picked up in the business planning process this year. Staff will be encouraged to ask for what they need.</p> <p>Q. What are plans for staff communications of survey results?</p> <p>A. Work was done at the last Training and Planning day with staff to drill down into the issues. It was noted that a large number of staff did not respond. The new Director of People Services would pick up action plans. Members of the Executive were now more visible around College.</p>	
11.3	ACTION: Develop a strategy for better people and staff engagement.	CEO
12	Annual Staff Professional Development Plan	
12.1	<p>Q. This report should take a much wider look at professional development?</p> <p>A. Agreed.</p>	
12.2	ACTION: The Annual Staff Professional Development Plan to be revised and presented at the next meeting.	CEO
13	HR Statistical Reports for previous year	
13.1	<p>DFCS provided an update for Governors.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> New HR reporting is now available. 4.8% of staff days were lost due to absence equating to 12 days per FTE per 	

	<p>annum.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attrition overall is 18.14%. • Short Term sickness increased significantly in February 2019. • Total headcount has reduced. This is a planned reduction. <p>Q. Does reporting include Beacon? A. No.</p> <p>Q. Does exclusion of Beacon staff impact on attrition data? A. This could be reviewed.</p> <p>Q. Can we add sector comparisons to the report? A. Yes this could be added.</p> <p>Q. Is Attrition a sector word? A. Staff turnover was an alternative which was more commonly used within the sector.</p> <p>Q. Days lost for sickness is high, is monitoring in place and are there action plans? A. There was a focus on sickness monitoring and action plans were in place. The HR team was working on this with managers.</p> <p>Q. Did 4.8% include strike days? A. Only if staff called in sick.</p> <p>Q. Are involuntary leavers redundancies? A. Redundancies were included.</p>	
13.2	<p>ACTION: Sector comparisons to be added to the HR report.</p> <p>ACTION: Beacon staff impacts on data to be reviewed.</p>	<p>DFCS</p> <p>DFCS</p>
13.3	<p>The CEO updated on Horizon Scanning and the Business Planning process. An early start was needed to agree goals for the Executive. Curriculum Strategy goals and People Strategy goals would need to be agreed.</p> <p>ACTION: Governors to discuss horizon scanning and goals at the next corporation meeting.</p>	<p>Govs</p>
<p>SR2: Failure to meet income targets SR3: Inability to maintain financial sustainability by failure to generate operating surpluses, control costs and manage cash flow SR9: Change in Government policy impacting on funding and quality assessments SR15: Failure to achieve a successful RF application outcome</p>		

Effective Governance		
14	Report on progress against Governance QIP	
14.1	<p>The Chair informed Governors that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Governance QIP was currently being developed in conjunction with the Interim Clerk. • There was a proposal to expand the remit of the Search Committee to incorporate Governance. • Chair's action had been taken to authorise the amendment of the Minutes of 13th September 2018 and 10th January 2019 to move confidential matters which were commercially sensitive to a confidential annex. 	
15	Update on Senior Post-Holder Appointments and External stakeholders	
15.1	<p>The CEO reported on the recruitment process for the post of Director of People Services.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interviews had taken place over two days. • Two candidates were shortlisted after day one for interview with a panel of Governors. • The Panel recommended the appointment of Dr S Cooper. <p style="text-align: center;">RESOLVED: That Dr S Cooper be appointed as the Director of People Services.</p>	
15.2	<p>The CEO was continuing to engage with external stakeholders including MP's and West Yorkshire college principals. Meetings with key employers would be prioritised. He had attended several student events.</p>	
15.3	<p>The Interim Finance Director was thanked again for all of his work for the College. Governors noted that he was due to leave at the end of April.</p>	
<p>SR17: Ineffective Governance SR1: Failure to appoint senior leaders with relevant skills and experience to be able to deliver clear strategy and strong leadership</p>		
Matters to Note		
16	Academic Board Meeting Minutes	
	<p>Governors received and noted the Minutes of the meeting of the Academic Board held on 7 November 2018.</p>	
17	Training for Braford (CTS) Board Meeting minutes	
	<p>Governors received and noted the Minutes of the Board meeting held on 24 January 2019.</p>	

18	Beacon Meeting Minutes – Not Applicable Noted.	
19	Inprint & Design Meeting Minutes Governors received and noted the Minutes of the Board meeting and the Annual General Meeting held on 26 February 2019.	
20	Equality & Diversity Committee Meeting Minutes Governors received and noted the Minutes of the meeting held on 21 November 2018.	
21	Health, Safety & Welfare Committee Meeting Minutes	
21.1	Governors received and noted the Minutes of the meeting held on 11 December 2018.	
21.2	Governors were concerned that the meeting of the Health, Safety and Welfare Committee was poorly attended. ACTION: DFCS to take actions to improve attendance at meetings of the Health, Safety and Welfare Committee.	DFCS
22	JCC Meeting Minutes Governors received and noted the Minutes of the meeting held on 24 January 2019. <i>L 18.10 Debbie Rolls, Rob Holden. Piers Telemacque.</i>	
23	<i>This matter was considered to be confidential at this stage and therefore the discussion was recorded in a confidential restricted annex at the end of this document marked Annex 1.</i>	
24	<i>This matter was considered to be confidential at this stage and therefore the discussion was recorded in a confidential restricted annex at the end of this document marked Annex 1.</i>	
25	Dates of Next Meetings:	
25.1	2 May 2019 (Corporation Away Day) 20 June 2019 18 July 2019	
Meeting Evaluation		
26	Meeting Evaluation	

	The meeting evaluation forms were circulated.	
27	Any Other Business	
27.1	<p>The Chair confirmed that Significant Risks had been noted as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Quality and Progress in Maths and English. 2. OfS Submissions and confirmation of registration conditions by August 2019. 3. OfS registration confirmation for our validating partner. 4. Decrease in income as reported in the Q2 forecast. 5. Potential loss of funding for BTEC courses. 6. Staff pay and morale. 7. Potential dispute with unions and the reputational impact on the college. 8. Speed of response for Safeguarding. 9. Attendance in HE. 10. HE Continuation rates. 11. Risk of restructuring delay. 12. Breach of RF agreement covenants. <p>The meeting closed at 18.55pm.</p>	

Agreed Actions

No	Minute	Action	Who?
1	5.3	Safeguarding reports to include an update on speed of response.	DCEO
2	5.3	All governors to complete online safeguarding training.	All governors
3	8.5	DFCS to provide feedback on the Lister Building issue.	DFCS
4	8.5	DCEO to provide feedback on the request for Social Space.	DCEO
5	8.5	DFCS to provide feedback on the request for catering facilities in ATC	DFCS
6	9.3	DFCS will present the Regulatory Self-Assessment Questionnaire at the next Audit Committee meeting.	DFCS
7	9.12	Staff pay and staff morale to be added to the risk register.	CEO
8	9.12	Communications with staff need to be reviewed and improved.	CEO
9	10.4	The CEO to present a Curriculum guide to the Corporation with impacts on funding. This will highlight challenges in managing the curriculum.	CEO
10	11.3	Develop a strategy for better people and staff engagement.	CEO
11	12.2	The Annual Staff Professional Development Plan to be revised and presented at the next meeting.	CEO
12	13.2	Sector comparisons to be added to the HR report.	DFCS
13	13.2	Beacon staff impacts on data to be reviewed.	DFCS
14	13.3	Governors to discuss horizon planning and goals at the next corporation meeting.	Govs
15	21.2	DFCS to take actions to improve attendance of the Health, Safety and Welfare Committee.	DFCS